Southend-on-Sea Borough Council

Report of Corporate Director for Place to Cabinet

on

23rd September 2014

Report prepared by: Nick Harris, Head of Culture

Library Service – Light Touch Review Executive Councillor: Cllr Graham Longley *A Part 1 Agenda Item*

1. Purpose of Report

- 1.1 To report on the findings from the Light-Touch Review of the decisions taken in respect of the Library Service Policy which was approved in December 2013.
- 1.2 To provide Members with a range of options which will enable them to identify and agree a sustainable model of service delivery for the Library Service.
- 1.3 To set out proposals regarding the location of the new Library to be built within the east of the borough.

2. Recommendations

- 2.1 Members approve proposed version 3 as set out in the report with Library branches operated by a paid member of staff supported by volunteers.
- 2.2 That Members approve Shoebury Youth Centre as the location for the new Library and the necessary building works to provide the facility.
- 2.3 That Members agree to bring forward the reprovision of Southchurch Library to enable this to take place within the short term and give permission for officers to explore a range of options for the Library and report back at a future meeting for a decision.
- 2.4 That the Library Strategy "Facing the Challenge 2013 2028" be amended to reflect the agreed changes.

Agenda Item No.

17

3. Background

- 3.1 The Community Services and Culture Scrutiny Committee agreed on 10th July 2012 to support a proposal for the Cultural Advisory Working Party to undertake a review of the Southend-on-Sea Library Service which would consider the future direction of the Library Service to achieve an effective, sustainable Library provision whilst reducing cost to assist in meeting the required Council spending reductions. It was agreed that one of the outcomes for the review would be the production of a draft libraries development strategy clearly setting out proposals for future service delivery to be agreed by Cabinet.
- 3.2 As directed the outcome of the review resulted in the approval of the Library strategy 'Facing the Challenge' by Full Council on 12th December 2013. The strategy outlines how the agreed recommendations of the review are to be implemented over a period of time to ensure that the Library Service remains fit for purpose to 2028 and beyond.
- 3.3 The strategy also details how the financial saving of £378,000 required from the Council by the Library Service during the period April 2013 March 2016 will be met and highlights fundamental changes in the management and operation of the branch network. The main changes agreed were:
 - The creation of community Managed Libraries at Southchurch and Westcliff with community groups taking on the responsibility for managing these branches.
 - The creation of community supported libraries at Kent Elms and Leigh for these branches council paid staff will remain but on a reduced basis. The council will look to recruit volunteers to work alongside paid staff to maintain the existing level of service (i.e. opening hours)
 - Both models of service delivery will be supported by the Council and will still form part of the council's statutory Library service.

(Please refer to **appendix 1** for full details of all of the previously agreed recommendations)

- 3.4 To support these changes funding to progress the installation of Wi-Fi across the entire branch network was approved along with £40,000 for additional resources to help with the transition to the new models of working; this support is to help staff, volunteers and community groups identify and create appropriate models of service delivery for each branch.
- 3.5 Other key items approved included the provision of a new Library in Delaware Road as a replacement for both Thorpedene and Friars Libraries during 2015 and the reprovision of Southchurch Library within the medium to long-term.
- 3.6 Subsequently, a capital budget allocation of £380,000 was approved by Council in February 2014, as part of setting the 2014/15 Budget for the provision of the new facility. This related to a new Library on a site in Delaware Road.

- 3.7 Following the local elections on 22 May a new Joint Administration was formed. The Joint Administration Agreement contains commitments to review previous Council decisions in relation to Shoeburyness flood defences, Delaware and Priory Care Homes and the Library Service.
- 3.8 At the first Cabinet meeting of the joint administration in July it was agreed that whilst accepting many of the outcomes and recommendations made in the approved Library Strategy, the Joint Administration would undertake a light touch review :-

"to reconsider the decisions that relate to the operation and management of the Library branch network. In particular this would look at the proposed staffing structure necessary to support the Library branch network and the appropriate use of and by community groups and volunteers".

4. Proposals for future delivery of the Branch Network

- 4.1 For the first three years of the Library Strategy, the service has been required to reduce its budget by £126,000 p.a. The saving for year 1 (2013/14) was met through a series of contract renegotiations, management changes and savings achieved through staff vacancies.
- 4.2 Further savings totalling £252,000 for 2014/15 and 2015/16 were to be met through a change in the management and operation of the branch network; primarily with the introduction of Community Managed / Supported Libraries at Kent Elms, Leigh, Southchurch and Westcliff along with a fully staffed new Library within the east of the borough.
- 4.3 **Table 1** (overleaf) summarises a range of options for the future delivery of the Library service. Each of the options details a number of issues for consideration and examines the achievability of the agreed savings target for the service.
- 4.4 All options have been based on the Forum continuing to operate in its present format in line with the currently approved strategy. Any alteration in the Forum's operational arrangements would have to be agreed formally through the Forum Management Company Limited following detailed negotiations with both South Essex College and the University of Essex.
- 4.5 Delays in delivering any of the options will impact upon the ability to achieve savings in the current and future years.
- 4.6 Any significant changes to the agreed strategy, which would lead to a reduced Library service provision, may require further statutory periods of public consultation.

4.7 Table 1: Branch Network Service Delivery Options

Status	Option / Scenario	Impact	Financial Impact	Comments
Continue with Review Proposals	Continue with agreed recommendations (approved by full-council 12/12/13)	 Introduction of Community Supported and Community Managed Branches at Leigh & Kent Elms by Sept 2014 Introduction of Community Managed Branches at Southchurch by Jan 2015 & Westcliff by March 2015 Includes reprovision of new Library arrangements in Delaware Road Includes reprovision of Southchurch Library 	Savings targets met in full (i.e.£378K over the 3 year period covering 13/14, 14/15 & 15/16)	Maximises development of community links Maintain and develop opportunities for branch development; particularly for Southchurch & Westcliff : Expansion of opening hours Additional services Income generation activities

Status	Option / Scenario	Impact	Financial Impact	Comments
Amended Proposals • Version 1	Southchurch & Westcliff to be managed in the same way as Kent Elms & Leigh (i.e. mix of paid staff & volunteers. This option assumes that both Friars and Thorpedene branches will close and that the new Library provision in the East of the Borough will go ahead (this will be fully staffed by paid employees).	Slight variation on original plan & could be implemented fairly quickly. Need to consider acceptable level of staffing	 Will not be able to implement full level of savings as required by March 2016. Current year: may be able to deliver most of saving – subject to timing of the decision. Next year projected saving of £126K will not be achieved. Total savings made as a result of the review would total £252K. Overall, a total base budget shortfall over two years of £126k against the original agreed saving. 	Need to keep good lines of communication with Community groups already interested in the management of some branches – to allow community development and to harness the progress already made in developing those relationships. Library budget would be contained at 14/15 budget level and, therefore, it would not possible to achieve the savings identified in 15/16 budget.

Status	Option / Scenario	Impact	Financial Impact	Comments
Amended Proposals • Version 2	Leigh & Kent Elms are being managed with paid staff and volunteers Full complement of paid staff to be maintained at Southchurch & Westcliff and also at Friars & Thorpedene (in the short-term)	 Impact No requirement to use volunteers or work with local community groups. Impact on long-term working with the local community Likely to be questions from Kent Elms / Leigh as why they are being treated differently in terms of paid staffing (both from staff and Library users). Staff recruitment & training (where appropriate) may take longer than anticipated 	 Financial impact Current year: may be able to deliver most of saving – subject to timing of the decision. The full year effect of these changes would be a shortfall in the base budget by £30K. Further saving of £126K will not be achieved for 2015/16. This option will make a total saving of £222K over the 3 year period to March 2016. Overall, a total base budget shortfall against the original target of £156k. 	 Comments How will the Library service develop locally? Service delivery is likely to be affected until the full complement of staff are in post. Future and on-going relationships with both community groups and members of the local community may be affected – this area will need to be handled sensitively given current relationships that have already been built.

Status	Option / Scenario	Impact	Financial Impact	Comments
Amended Proposals • Version 3 **PREFERRED OPTION**	All branches to become community libraries mix of paid staff and volunteers: • Kent Elms • Leigh • Southchurch • Westcliff • New East Library Each branch will work flexibly and pragmatically to reflect the needs of the local community, be given discretion to organise activities and change opening hours (but not to exceed the currently funded allocation).	Original model of Hub Library provision in East and West of the Borough is removed – all branches to be managed with the same operational conditions. Appropriate staffing levels to be determined for the East Library provision. May require further restructure of the staffing structure Volunteer recruitment drive for the East Library provision will be required.	Current year: may be able to deliver most of saving – subject to timing of the decision. Saving of £126K achievable in 2015/16 subject to:- • timing of the decision • Friars is closed by 31 st March 2015, & • Opening hours at Thorpedene extended temporarily until new East Library opens. Alternatively, keep Friars open until the new East Library is operational - this is likely to have a short term impact on the budget (circa £30k) Total savings will meet the previous budget targets set.	This model would result in a new staffing structure and would require additional consultation with staff. May require additional interim staffing arrangements in respect of Friars Library.

Status	Option / Scenario	Impact	Financial Impact	Comments
Status Re-start the Review	Option / Scenario Undo the review completely & develop a new strategy	Impact A new review would require considerable time & staff resources needed to undertake this. Work that has been done to date with local community groups and residents would be halted.	Financial Impact£252K would be required to be re- instated in the Library budget.Ability to make any further contribution to the agreed savings target would not be possible within the timeframe required.There will be a financial cost involved in undertaking the review, which will include future public consultation.	Comments Clear parameters for a new review will need to be established Further phases of public consultation will be required if significant changes are suggested Short-term arrangements will need to be put in place for the delivery of the Library Service whilst the review is on-going.
			consultation.	

5. Other options for Branch Network Service Delivery

- 5.1 To make the savings consideration could be given to reducing the current opening hours by half across the entire branch network. Whilst this option would achieve the required level of savings, it would likely restrict the ability of the service to develop in the future and would hamper access to the Library service for a significant proportion of local residents and people working and studying in the borough.
- 5.2 If this option is adopted further public consultation will be required in order to avoid a legal challenge and ensure the council is able to meet its legal duty to provide a "comprehensive and efficient Library service" for the people who live, work and study in the borough.

6 **Proposals for the location of the new East Library:**

- 6.1 Two possible sites have been identified along Delaware Road as possible locations for the new Library provision in the east of the borough: a joint newbuild with Thorpedene School or a reconfiguration of Shoebury Youth Centre. Both schemes have the potential to provide a high-quality, impressive Library for the area.
- 6.2 Provision will be made for 'pop up Libraries' and the flexible use of the mobile Library to supplement community access to Library provision in the east of the Borough.

6.3 **Option 1:**

- 6.3.1 The new-build option at Thorpedene School would form the first floor above new teaching areas. Access to the Library would be via a lift. The design of the building would allow for the Library area to have its own entrance enabling it to be used entirely separately from the school premises. Full access would be possible for the public during school holidays. There will be a parking provision for approximately twenty cars. Early indicative estimates of the costs for the Library element are that they are likely to be in the region of £500,000 (this amount is in excess of the budget approved within the capital programme). The school require the build to be completed in time for the start of the new academic year in September 2015.
- 6.3.2 This option would particularly attract parent and young children, a group that the Library Service already serves well. Libraries on school sites can be difficult for those who had a poor experience at school though this scheme would endeavour to manage this perceived issue.
- 6.3.3 This proposal within the Thorpedene School would involve a rent payment to the school at some stage in the future. The school is fully supportive of the proposals but Members will be aware of the speed of change in school governance and the nature of the change. Academy status or some similar

status for the schools cannot be ruled out; this is a potential risk to the future proofing of the scheme and could result in the transfer of assets.

6.4 **Option 2 (Preferred Proposal):**

- 6.4.1 A re-configuration of Shoebury Youth Centre would provide a first floor Library with lift access. Associated works for the Youth Service would see the ground floor reconfigured to provide space needed by the Department for People. Shoebury Youth Centre also provides a café on site and the proposed reconfiguration would make the building a community centre, attracting users of all ages. Once the Library has opened the building would become Shoebury Youth and Community Centre.
- 6.4.2 There is a large car park at the site, shared with the Leisure Centre and Shoebury School. Management arrangements for this Car Park would need to be formalised to ensure sufficient parking at all times when the Library would need it.
- 6.4.3 Indicative estimates of the costs for the Library element are in the region of £380,000. If this option is approved the scheme could be completed within 12 months with the facility opening Autumn / Winter 2015. Shoebury Youth Centre was built with National Lottery funding and there are covenants that cover the possible uses, however the Library element of the proposed changes would not breach these covenants.
- 6.4.4 The usage of Shoebury Youth Centre facility with the provision of a new Library has additional advantages of increased footfall to facilities within the building together with shared building management and service costs.
- 6.4.5 For the advantages described above, as well as the lower capital cost, it is suggested that this is the preferred proposal.

6.5 **Other options for the East Library location**

- 6.5.1 Other options were considered in depth during the Library Review.
- 6.5.2 One option would be to do nothing. This would mean that Thorpedene Library would remain at the current site as the East Library and Friars Library would close without a better building replacing it. Shoebury Youth Centre would remain under utilised and shared use benefits not achieved. There may be an opportunity cost as the Delaware site would be closed to development. Thorpedene Library has significant short and medium term maintenance requirements, totalling £350,000 over the next 5 years. This option would not allow the Library Strategy agreed by the Council to be delivered or achieve the required financial savings.
- 6.5.3 Consideration has been given to using the old Area Housing Office on Delaware Road but this is not a suitable to be used as a local Library building

as it has been refurbished and is currently being used by Department for People as a Family Contact Centre and it lacks parking.

6.5.4 Consideration has also been given to building on a different site in Delaware Road, but no suitable site currently exists.

7 Reprovision of Southchurch Library

- 7.1 There has been a branch Library in Southchurch since 1931, originally the Library was located at Southchurch Hall (now the museum) and transferred to its present purpose built location in 1972. The building is located behind Strand House in Southchurch Road, with which it shares a small car park.
- 7.2 The premises consist of a single storey prefabricated building with a total floor area of 185m². The building had an original anticipated lifespan of 25 years (from 1972).
- 7.3 The current premises were initially refurbished in early 1993 and again in 2002. Further improvements have included the installation of automatic doors during 2008 and RFID (self-service machines) installed in 2011.
- 7.4 As part of the Library Review an Asset Review on the branch network was undertaken in December 2012 to identify any major maintenance requirements and potential future uses for each of the sites (see **Appendix 2** for the details of Southchurch Library).
- 7.5 It is acknowledged that the present building which houses Southchurch Library has gone some years beyond its intended lifespan and that the demountable building itself is getting to the point that it is beyond repair. The Library Strategy 2013 - 2028 therefore proposed that Southchurch Library should be reprovisioned in the medium-term (5-10 years).
- 7.6 Members of the Joint Administration have expressed a desire to see Southchurch Library reprovisioned in the short-term rather than in the medium-term as foreseen in the Library Strategy. It is recommended that Members give permission for officers to explore a range of options for the reprovisioning of Southchurch Library in the short-term and report back to a future meeting for a decision.

8 Reason for recommendations

- 8.1 It is recommended that Members give consideration to adopting version 3 of the amended proposals so that all branches to become community libraries with a member of paid member of staff supported by volunteers to deliver the current number of opening hours at:
 - o Kent Elms
 - o Leigh
 - Southchurch
 - o Westcliff
 - New East Library

- 8.2 The preferred service delivery proposal does not represent a significant alteration in the service delivery model agreed in the Library Strategy and also has the added advantages that it can be implemented relatively quickly and is affordable.
- 8.3 One of the key messages taken from the consultation during the initial Library Review was the importance Library users and residents placed on the branch network. Subsequent meetings and discussions with local people and groups continues to confirm the importance of their local Library. This model supports the retention of the branch network.
- 8.4 Following the approval of the Library Strategy there has been considerable engagement with members of local communities, potential volunteers, community groups and third sector representatives. This work has identified capacity within the community to support the delivery of the Library service.
- 8.5 This option is flexible enough to allow the service to develop and continue to work with local residents and community groups to maximise the use of each branch as a relevant community asset for example, this may include the use of the building for other services outside of 'core hours' or for additional community services to be provided within the branch this would be possible with volunteer support.
- 8.6 This option will also support the pragmatic approach previously agreed for the delivery of the branch network, recognising that a 'one-size fits all' approach may not necessarily deliver the best solution for the locality or Library service. For example, working with the local community and volunteers it may be possible for each branch to determine the opening hours to suit that locality. The council will require the current level of opening hours to be maintained but will not be so rigid on the pattern of opening.
- 8.7 In respect of the new East Library the Shoebury Youth Centre proposal is the preferred option for reasons of affordability, the ability to maximise the use of a council owned asset which is not being used to its full capacity and the ability for to attract a wide range of people of all ages and abilities.
- 8.8 The current Southchurch Library building was only ever intended as 25 year solution in 1972 and has been due for replacement since 1997. The building has stood the test of time for forty-two years and has had several minor refurbishments in the interim. The Asset Review clarifies the need to replace the building. This provides an opportunity to look at the current site and assess how a Library could be better incorporated into that site or, indeed find an alternative site that could meet the needs of both the Library and the local population in a more appropriate way.

9 Corporate Implications

9.1 Contribution to Council's Vision & Corporate Priorities

The proposals contained within this report contribute directly to the following aims and objectives of the council:-

- HEALTHY Support Southend to be active and alive with sport and culture.
- PROSPEROUS Reduce inequalities and increase the life choices of people living in Southend.
- EXCELLENT Deliver targeted services that meet the identified needs of our community

9.2 Financial Implications

- 9.2.1 The target saving of 15% of controllable Library service budget, equating to £378,000 of a total controllable budget of £2,546,000, was required to form part of the Library review outcome. It was agreed that a phased approach to making the savings over the three year period 13/14, 14/15 and 15/16 would take place. The 2013/14 budget saving of £126,000 and 2014/15 reduction of £126,000 has already been removed from the service area as part of the budget agreed by Council.
- 9.2.2 Table 1 summarises the financial implications of each of the potential options for the operational delivery of the branch network and the impact that each of the options is likely to have on the ability of the service to meet the total saving of £378,000 required by March 2016.
- 9.2.3 It should be noted that delays in delivering any of the options will impact upon the achievability of making the required savings of £126k in each year. If this is the case then alternative savings options will need to be considered to ensure the Council has a balanced budget.
- 9.2.4 Savings of £13k were made within the 14/15 Youth Service budget in anticipation of shared use of the Shoebury Youth Centre. If the preferred option is not approved then savings will not be achieved.
- 9.2.5 In respect of the East Library a budget allocation of £380,000 was approved by Council on 27 February 2014, as part of setting the 2014/15 budget for the provision of the new facility. This related to a new Library on a site in Delaware Road. This sum would be sufficient to deliver the preferred option 2 of a re-configuration of Shoebury Youth Centre to accommodate an East Library.
- 9.2.6 There is no existing capital budget provision for the reprovision of Southchurch library. Any funding would need to be considered as part of the capital programme review as part of the annual Budget process.

9.3 Legal Implications

- 9.3.1 The statutory basis for the Library Service is "The Public Libraries and Museum Act 1964". The Local Authority has the statutory duty to provide, under the superintendence of the Secretary of State, a free, comprehensive and efficient Library Service for all who wish to use it. The Act requires Libraries to provide facilities for borrowing books and other materials for persons whose residence or place of work is in the area or who are undergoing full time education. It also states that local authorities "must encourage adults and children to make full use of the service and provide advice".
- 9.3.2 The Occupation of the building housing the new East Library, depending on the option agreed, may require legal agreements or Service Level Agreements for which assistance will be sought from the Council's Property Services and the Head of Legal and Democratic Services.

9.4 People Implications

- 9.4.1 The implementation of the approved Library Strategy has had significant implications for Library Staff. Delivery of those proposals involves a reduction in the existing staff employed at the branches and the restructure of the Library Management Team to enable the creation of a Community Libraries Support Outreach Team.
- 9.4.2 Those proposals have subsequently been subject to formal consultation with staff and Trades Unions and considerable work has been undertaken to put the new staffing structure in place. This has included:-
 - the appointment of a Volunteer Co-ordinator and a Library Manager with overall responsibility for the branch network has also been appointed – this role also encompasses a level of responsibility for Community Managed branches.
 - 12 members of Library Staff have applied and been accepted for voluntary redundancy (this took place before the local elections) – the statutory position is that notices can only be withdrawn or extended but this **MUST** be with the mutual consent of both the employer and the employee. To date none of these employees have requested a review of their voluntary redundancy decision and some of these staff have subsequently left.
- 9.4.3 Interim staffing arrangements have come into place in summer 2014 whilst the Light Touch Review is undertaken. If changes are made to the proposals, staffing levels in the Library Service will not be aligned to the service being delivered. This can be managed for 3-4 months but is not sustainable beyond that and further interim arrangements will need to be put in place; for which there will be additional budget implications.
- 9.4.4 If the preferred proposal for the future of the Branch Network Service Delivery is approved there will be staffing implications; the staffing structure to deliver the previously approved proposals was based on the provision of

full staffing levels at the new East Library location and full staffing in the West of the Borough (shared between both Kent Elms and Leigh). This preferred proposal allows for a paid member of staff at each of the branches during its current core opening hours. Overall, the staffing levels are likely to remain the same but the structure will need to be reconfigured to take account of the new arrangements. This will be done in consultation with both the staff and the trade unions.

9.5 **Property Implications**

- 9.5.1 The proposals will maximise the use of the Shoebury Youth Centre building and seek to identify an improved and more efficient Library building for Southchurch, whilst also allowing better use of the site.
- 9.5.2 Friars Library will close and cease to be an operational property within the Library service. The property will return to Asset Management with its future use to be determined corporately.

9.6 **Consultation**

- 9.6.1 There has been extensive consultation as part of the Library Review:-
 - 14 week period of initial consultation to gather information on patterns of usage and ideas for the future from 3rd October 2012 – 6th January 2013; during this time there were additional workshop sessions with Library staff, Library volunteers and Members.
 - 12 week period of formal public consultation on the proposals contained within the approved Library Development Strategy 2013 - 2028 from 10th June 2013 - 8th September 2013.
- 9.6.2 In addition to the direct responses to the questionnaire, the Council also received letters from local schools, community groups and members of the public as well as petitions from Leigh Town Council, Friends of Kent Elms Library and UNISON.
- 9.6.3 Subsequent to the approval of the Library Strategy there has been considerable engagement with members of local communities, potential volunteers, community groups and third sector representatives. This work has identified capacity within the community to support the delivery of the Library service.
- 9.6.4 The preferred proposals within this document do not suggest a significant alteration in service delivery and therefore, it is considered that additional public consultation is not required.

9.7 Equalities and Diversity Implications

9.7.1 An equality assessment was carried out on the original proposals within the Library Strategy; the recommendations contained within this report do not create any additional negative impacts for those groups with protected characteristics and therefore the current assessment still applies.

9.8 Risk Assessment

The key risks identified within this report are:

Risk	Impact/Likelihood High (H) Medium (M) Low (L)	Mitigation
Required savings will not be met.	Impact (H) Likelihood (H)	The preferred option identified within this report is the only option that will deliver the required savings. It should be noted that any delays in implementing service changes will have a negative impact on achieving the overall savings target by March 2016.
Staffing levels will not be sufficient to sustain the service	Impact (H) Likelihood (H)	Interim staffing arrangements have been put in place across the summer; however these arrangements are only likely to be sustainable until 31 st December 2014
Significant failure of the Southchurch Library building leading to closure of the branch	Impact (H) Likelihood (H)	Options for a new library within Southchurch are pursued sooner rather than later.
Significant failure of the Southchurch Library building leading to closure of the branch	Impact (H) Likelihood (H)	Options for a new Library within Southchurch are pursued sooner rather than later.
Community capacity to support the branch network is reduced	Impact (H) Likelihood (M)	Continued engagement with the local community
Lack of volunteers to support the new East Library	Impact (H) Likelihood (M)	Volunteer recruitment drive will be undertaken in the East of the Borough

9.9 Value for Money

9.9.1 The proposals recommended represent the best value for money option.

9.10 Community Safety Implications

9.10.1 There are none.

9.11 Environmental Impact

9.11.1 There are none.

10. Background Papers

10.1 "Facing the Challenge" Library Development Strategy 2013–2025.

11. Appendices

- 11.1 Summary of changes incorporated within "Facing the Challenge".
- 11.2 Southchurch Library Property Summary Sheet.